

however, might expand the notion of liturgy to the life of the Church and its formative expressions. Discerning how educational endeavors model the themes of oblation, doxology, and *epiclesis* might give new understanding to previous pedagogical practices. In some areas Christian religious educators have already made great strides to foster *anamnesis* by means of narrative models of education. But a liturgical understanding of pedagogy would provide a helpful referent for advocating certain practices without violent or oppressive conclusions. Formative practices, for instance, would not be understood as a modified form of behaviorism, but as the ordering of doxological space for the sake of transformation. Practices of hospitality and compassion would reconcile not only strangers to the community of faith but also the stranger within. At least Christian religious educators and liturgists must ask how different forms of worship and different educational practices encourage violence or harmony in their implicit agendas. If pedagogical practices can model liturgical designs, if they can become sacramental (in the broad sense) in nature, they may promote an understanding of the person-in-community that respects the deep theological interrelationships between self, community, and God.

Dean G. Blevins, Pd. D. is J. P. Elizer Professor of Christian Ministries at Trevecca Nazarene University, Nashville, Tennessee, and editor of the online journal *Didache: Faithful Teaching*.

## Book Reviews

Jill Y. Crainshaw. *Wise and Discerning Hearts: An Introduction to Wisdom Liturgical Theology*. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2000. 284 pages. Paper. ISBN 0-8146-6182-3. \$32.95.

In this learned, insightful book Jill Crainshaw works out a massive prolegomenon for a highly promising methodology for liturgical theology, one that would ground its practical character and, thus, liturgy's viability, in the wisdom theology of the Old Testament. Given the limit the author places on the project of this book, namely, "to engage representatives from each of the fields [of practical theology, liturgical theology, and wisdom theology] for the purpose of creating a mutually critical dialogue that is necessary to the development of the proposed methodology" (21), the subtitle of the book falls a bit short of its mark. While one could not reasonably expect the publisher to put the term *prolegomenon* on the cover, nevertheless, Crainshaw's work is not an introduction to wisdom liturgical theology. A more apt subtitle would be "Toward a Wisdom Liturgical Theology." I belabor this point at the outset because I occasionally got frustrated reading the book until I remembered once again that Crainshaw disavows actually setting forth the new methodology itself. A wisdom liturgical theology per se remains on the horizon of her thought.

Reaching back more than twenty-five years to prophetic warnings Langdon Gilkey and Walter Burghart addressed at Scottsdale to the founding members of the North American Academy of Liturgy, Crainshaw takes up a challenge her senior colleagues have yet adequately to face: the pervasiveness of historical positivism in their work. This positivism seriously impedes the progress of liturgical renewal and theology on two counts, Crainshaw argues. First, by embracing a positivist "redemptive history" approach to scripture and tradition, liturgical theologians have been less than effective in countering

Christianity's growing irrelevance in modern society.

Approaching liturgy as the correlation of the contemporary invitation of grace with specific events of divine intervention in the (redemptive) past has reaped ever-diminishing pastoral/practical results. Unable to make connections with uncritically rehearsed narratives of salvation history, contemporary liturgical participants struggle to recognize and respond to divine revelation in their own lives. A further problem lies in liturgists' positivist theological claims for the practical significance (the transformative impact) of certain traditional elements of Christian liturgy upon those who perform them. By placing so much credence in certain historical ritual elements and politics, liturgical theologians have perpetuated ideologies widely untenable to contemporary Christians. Crainshaw notes the increasingly empty, if not abandoned, church buildings across the mainline Christian landscape.

To counter this deteriorating state of theological and practical affairs Crainshaw turns to two resources: practical theology, especially as propounded by Edward Farley, and wisdom theology, as developed by such biblical scholars as Walter Brueggemann and Kathleen O'Connor. Learning from Farley how merely structural or post-structural appropriations of sacred texts are inadequate to the content of the Church's scriptures, Crainshaw adopts his theory of "reflective ontology," brilliantly relating it to the work of liturgical theologian David Power. Standing on one shoulder of each of these two theological giants—Protestant and Catholic—Crainshaw enlists her own formidable theological and homiletic skills to argue the need for a liturgical methodology that strikes an ontologically "dynamic balance between divine presence and historical structures of mediation" (132).

Crainshaw's model and scriptural source for such a method is the wisdom corpus of the Old Testament, with its practice of "reflective thinking" engaging "a horizon that merges mystery and clarity" (165). Having emerged in an ancient religion shaken and struggling to adapt to significantly altered social surroundings, Wisdom literature holds a deep affinity with the challenges the Church faces in our postmodern, postcolonial world. Master

narratives of history must serve the faith in concert with biblically inspired anthropology and cosmology so as to help contemporary believers encounter the action of grace in their daily lives. Crainshaw offers sizable chapters examining Proverbs 1–9 and the Book of Job to demonstrate Wisdom theology's deep affinities with liturgical theology. In the end, however, those chapters become increasingly frustrating, as Crainshaw almost slips into a sort of *eisegesis* of those texts, rehearsing their crucial theological insights only to then report how those ancient thoughts "echo" or "parallel" or "dialogue with" or "recall" the ideas of such contemporary theologians as Farley or Power or Saliers or Lathrop or Schmemmann. Although such a characterization may be unfair, still, I found myself disappointed to be left only with a string of "connections," insightful as they indeed are. The big remaining question is just how the wisdom contained in the literary structures of ancient texts can be practically transliterated into contemporary liturgical rites.

The scope and length of the book at times caused the author and copy editor to lose control of its scholarly mechanisms. With scores of footnotes per chapter, some texts erroneously receive full citation more than once (e.g., 117 n.130, 108 n.106), some footnotes are incomplete (e.g., 220 n.81 provides no page number for a lengthy direct quote), and others contain faulty information (e.g., 55 n.71, B. Morrill wrote his Ph.D. dissertation at Emory University, not Boston College). In the later chapters the author struggles at times with the difficult task of reintroducing previously explained theorists or concepts without distracting the reader from her current argument. This is not by any means, however, to imply that the reading does not repay the effort. To the contrary! Crainshaw has mastered a vast range of theological literature and presented the fruits of her research in a way that will benefit students in graduate courses of liturgical theology, as well as anyone seeking to get a comprehensive grasp of the discipline's most urgent questions.

Prolegomenon that it is, Crainshaw's book ends with her promise to develop a wisdom liturgical method on the basis of her correlation of practical, liturgical, and sapiential theologies.

Given her initial success in this book, one can only look forward to her further contributions, wishing her Godspeed in the work.

Bruce T. Morrill, S.J.  
Boston College  
Boston, MA

James R. Davila. *Liturgical Works. Eerdman's Commentaries on the Dead Sea Scrolls*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2000. 338 pages. Paper. ISBN 0-8028-2634-2. \$25.00.

Davila's *Liturgical Works* is the first of Eerdman's projected sixteen -volume series of expert scholarly commentaries and translations of "every translatable manuscript found at Qumran" (flyleaf). This volume confines itself to those manuscripts that "show evidence of composition for use in the ritual life of ancient Judaism" (2), excluding some marginally ritual works that the editors of the series assigned to other volumes (2, n.2). Davila's primary source for his texts is the *Discoveries in the Judean Desert* (DJD), especially Baillet's vol. VII, which, with French translation and commentary, collects the many liturgical manuscripts discovered in Cave 4 at Qumran. The current quick pace of official publication of the Qumran texts assures that Eerdmans will need to publish a second edition of the entire series in the near future.

Davila's chapters each follow the same pattern. He begins with a brief introduction in which he describes the manuscript itself, discusses its genre, and attempts to situate it within what is known of Qumran society as well as possible sources in biblical Judaism and parallels in rabbinic Judaism. Following this, he lists the bibliography relevant to the chapter. As far as I could determine, he consulted very few works published in Hebrew. For instance, he notes that Esther Chazon's important but as-yet unpublished dissertation on the Words of the Luminaries, obtainable on microfilm, "was not available to me" (243). While the vast

majority of significant publications on Qumran have been in western languages, this is not true of much recent work on early rabbinic liturgy and mysticism. Davila's translations follow, fragment by fragment, with ample technical notes, accompanied by line-by-line commentaries explaining his readings and contrasting them with the readings of others. Many of these notes and comments are meaningful only to a sophisticated reader.

Davila has organized his texts according to their conventional numbers. Thus, he begins with the very fragmentary Festival Prayers, followed by 4QBerakhot, Songs of the Sabbath Sacrifice, Times for Praising God, Grace after Meals, A Lamentation, A Wedding Ceremony?, Daily Prayers, The Words of the Luminaries, and Purification Rituals. From a liturgical perspective, this ordering is highly miscellaneous. One wonders whether a more thematic organization—within this thematically determined volume—might have taught the reader more about Qumran liturgy. It would have been particularly valuable to begin with the more complete manuscripts.

The fundamental purpose of this series is apparently to provide translation and phrase-by-phrase commentary on the texts rather than a coherent understanding of the corpus as a whole. As a result, Davila introduces his volume with a superficial twelve-page overview covering the place of liturgical texts within the Qumran library, fundamental concepts of Qumran theology that shape its liturgy, the biblical ritual background within which these texts function, the Qumran liturgies themselves, and finally later Jewish liturgy, both rabbinic and mystical. While these topics do create an appropriate lens through which to begin understanding Qumran liturgy, they each require much more detailed treatments. It might have served this volume better just to have synthesized recent reconstructions by leading scholars of the ritual life at Qumran. Any reader trying to make sense of these fragments will require a much deeper background in Second Temple Judaism than Davila is able to provide in his introduction.

The superficiality of Davila's introduction is mitigated somewhat by his introductions to the individual chapters. However, here too I found his comments frequently unsatisfying.