

THE POLITICS OF TRANSNATIONAL FEMINIST DISCOURSE:
FRAMING ACROSS DIFFERENCES, BUILDING SOLIDARITIES

By

LYNDI HEWITT

Dissertation

Submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate School of Vanderbilt University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements

for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

Sociology

August, 2009

Nashville, Tennessee

Approved:

Professor Holly J. McCammon

Professor Karen E. Campbell

Professor Larry W. Isaac

Professor Brooke A. Ackerly

Copyright © 2009 by Lyndi Hewitt
All Rights Reserved

For Matt

Who remains the best decision I've ever made

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The journey to completion of this manuscript has been long. Longer than it should have been. And while I have worked incredibly hard in many ways, this process has taught me more than anything else in my life that such difficult journeys are never completed individually. Although very cliché, the “village” concept is appropriate here. I am fortunate to have had a highly effective team of intellectual, emotional, and practical supporters along the way. To all of them, I offer my deepest gratitude.

The greatest satisfaction around this project comes from my hope that it will serve as a launching pad for research that makes a difference in the lives of women. To all the feminist activists whom I’ve observed in action and talked with in these last few years, I am indebted to you for sharing your tremendous insights, courage, and tenacity.

I could not ask for a better dissertation committee. Without Holly McCammon’s unwavering patience and persistence this project would never have been finished; I wanted to work with her because I knew she would push me to make my work the best it could be, and she did not disappoint. Thanks to her meticulous guidance, I will leave graduate school with the utmost confidence in my training. I hope that my work will make her proud. My continuing affection goes to Karen Campbell, who, since I was 19 years old, has been dispensing critical advice, making me laugh, catching my typos, and teaching me valuable lessons for life and work. I can’t imagine I’d have stuck it out without your encouragement. Brooke Ackerly taught me what it means to be a feminist scholar, parent, and person, and patiently mentored me through the journey while my theoretical understandings caught up with my identity. Because of her, I found a

meaningful project and a research agenda for which my passion will never be in question. Larry Isaac provided much-appreciated professional development opportunities and thoughtful insights at crucial points in the process, thus pushing my thinking and enhancing my training in important ways.

Thanks to Melissa Snarr for reminding me that you don't have to be inaccessible to be smart and respected, and for sharing important, liberating revelations at just the right moments. Tony Brown deserves substantial credit for providing invaluable guidance on professional issues, and for helping me, in a scary year, navigate the academic job market while dissertating. I will always be indebted to Peggy Thoits, who shepherded me through my first experience with social research, encouraged me to pursue this path, and remains one of the most brilliant, yet humble, sociologists I've ever known.

I am also very grateful to my past, present, and ongoing interlocutors in the Global Feminisms Collaborative for providing a critical yet nurturing intellectual space that has energized me continually. I fear that I may never find a group quite like this again. Thank you Melissa, Darcy, Sarah, Katy, Sonalini, Shubhra, Brandi, Rosanne, Anastasia, Susan, and Brooke.

Over the years, I have received generous financial support from various sources at Vanderbilt. Thanks to the College of Arts and Science, the Center for the Study of Religion and Culture, the Center for Ethics, the Center for Teaching, the Department of Sociology, and the Global Feminisms Collaborative for enabling me to do this work.

The role of practical support on this journey should not be underestimated. I must thank Hans and Claire, my favorite baristas at Portland Brew, for keeping me adequately

caffeinated, sharing funny stories, and reminding me not to take myself so seriously. I am fortunate to have found the loving and skilled teachers at Belmont Weekday School and Linden Waldorf School. Leaving Ellie in their capable hands each day allowed me to focus on my work and feel at peace knowing that she was well cared for.

My smart, generous, funny, and supportive friends have bolstered me in times of need and always helped me enjoy life outside of work, which I have found to be essential. Special thanks to Jason, Kristen, Kat, Sonalini, and Michelle; I am privileged to have your friendship.

Heather Talley and Laura Taylor have been and continue to be so many things to me. These women have soul. They were nothing short of vital throughout this process. They have stimulated my thinking, celebrated with me, grieved with me, talked me down from the ledge on countless occasions, and generally proved to be indispensable companions. Heather has challenged me intellectually and politically, perhaps not realizing how much I've learned from listening to her and being in community with her. Laura sat with me day after day as I trudged along – even when it was ugly to watch – sharing with me in joys and pains, big and small, and making it possible for me to get up in the morning and not dread my work. I will miss these women terribly.

I am blessed and thankful to rest in the unconditional love of my family, most of whom haven't really understood what I've been doing all this time, but who supported and humored me anyway. My mom managed to instill in me enough naïve confidence and optimism that it wasn't entirely wiped out by the end of graduate school. Thanks to my dad, I will never underestimate the importance of communicating effectively and of infusing life with humor wherever possible. Carol, Linda, and Amanda nurtured me

consistently in multiple ways, often knowing just what I needed to hear, and swooping in to take care of Ellie when I most needed help. My sister, Laura, reminds me repeatedly of the usefulness of sociological tools in everyday life, and serves as a daily example that it is a gift to love what you do.

Finally, I am enormously grateful to and in awe of Matt and Ellie, my loves. And to the baby girl who will soon make her appearance and join our family. None of this means anything without you. Thank you for being with me on this journey; I can't wait to see what happens next.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
DEDICATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES.....	x
Chapter	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
The Case for Studying Framing Practices in the Transnational Women’s Movement.....	4
Overview of Chapters.....	10
II. HISTORICAL AND THEORETICAL BACKGROUND.....	13
Introduction.....	13
Transnational Women’s Movements: A Historical Look.....	13
Theoretical Underpinnings of the Study: Frames and Framing in Social Movements.....	23
Review of Contributions.....	64
III. METHODOLOGY AND METHODS.....	67
Introduction.....	67
Methodology.....	67
Research Design.....	74
IV. MAPPING THE LANDSCAPE OF FRAME VARIATION AMONG CONTEMPORARY TRANSNATIONAL FEMINIST NETWORKS.....	104
Introduction.....	104
The Landscape of Transnational Feminist Framing.....	105
Discussion.....	120
V. ORGANIZATIONAL-LEVEL EXPLANATIONS FOR INTRAMOVEMENT DIFFERENCES IN FRAMING RESPONSES TO HEGEMONY.....	125
Introduction.....	125
Hegemonic Ideology in the Contemporary Global Context.....	127
QCA Results.....	132

Discussion.....	151
VI. FRAMING ACROSS DIFFERENCES, BUILDING SOLIDARITIES.....	161
Introduction.....	161
Sources of Division for the Contemporary Transnational Women’s Movement.....	164
The Need for Constructing Shared Frames within Diverse Movements.....	172
Collective Action Frames as Tools for Managing Differences.....	178
Commonalities among Collective Action Frames Invoked in Attempts to Address Intramovement Differences.....	197
Discussion.....	199
VII. CONCLUSION.....	204
Key Findings of the Dissertation.....	204
Theoretical, Empirical, and Methodological Contributions.....	206
Limitations of the Project.....	208
Future Research.....	210
Appendix	
A. WORLD SOCIAL FORUM WORKSHOPS AND SEMINARS ATTENDED.....	214
B. CO-OCCURRENCES OF FRAME CATEGORIES AMONG THE SAMPLE OF TRANSNATIONAL FEMINIST NETWORKS.....	217
C. QCA RESULTS FOR CHALLENGING HEGEMONY (EXCLUDING “FEMINIST” AND “MULTI-ISSUE” CONDITIONS).....	219
REFERENCES.....	220

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
2.1 Research Hypotheses.....	65
3.1 List of Sampled Transnational Feminist Networks.....	79
3.2 Overview of Collective Action Frames of TFNs.....	91
3.3 Construction of Independent Variables in the QCA.....	94
3.4 Descriptive Statistics for the Sample of Transnational Feminist Networks.....	99
4.1 Overview of Collective Action Frames of TFNs.....	107
5.1 Examples of Frames that Challenge vs. Harness Hegemony.....	131
5.2 Descriptive Overview of the Outcome of Interest: Response to Hegemony.....	133
5.3 QCA Results for Challenging Hegemony.....	137