Running head: BLACK GIRL, BE! CREATING TRANSFORMATIVE SPACES FOR BLACK GIRLS IN PUBLIC EDUCATION SCHOOLS

Black Girl, Be! Creating Transformative Spaces for Black Girls in Public Education Schools

Jewel Williams

Vanderbilt University
Abstract

Throughout history, Black children have been dehumanized, criminalized, and sexualized. Additionally, though education can be a transformative and liberative tool, Black children have been deprived of quality and equitable education or pushed out of schools and into confinement through harsh punitive punishments that have oftentimes been found to be rooted in racism, sexism, classism, etc. Unfortunately, most of the advocacy and research that is has been done up until recently has been focused on the treatment of Black boys in society. While many advocacy and activist groups are working to change systems for Black boys, our Black girls are receiving harsher juvenile justice sentences and more punitive punishments than any other group of girls and are the fastest growing population in departments of juvenile justice. This paper discusses the keys—outlined by Dr. Monique Morris— that are needed to incorporate transformative practices for Black girls in schools. These keys are: a race conscious gender analysis; an erasure of respectability politics in Schools; a centered response to victimization; high expectations for all Students; practices that facilitate healing opportunities for Black girls; and a centering of voices of color and experiential knowledge.

*Keywords:* Pushout, transformative, Black girls, healing, race, gender, social justice
Introduction

In 2014, Dr. Kimberlé Crenshaw and her associates released a report entitled, Black Girls Matter: Pushed Out, Overpoliced, and Underprotected. In this report, Crenshaw set out to bring light to some of the data that focused on how Black girls are experiencing school pushout and criminalization in schools. She states:

The challenge is real. Black girls receive more severe sentences when they enter the juvenile justice system than do members of any other group of girls, and they are also the fastest growing population in the system. Despite these troubling trends, there is very little research highlighting the short and long term effects of overdiscipline and pushout on girls of color (p. 6).

Up until this point, most of the conversations that were happening around the “school-to-prison pipeline” focused on Black Boys who were experiencing suspension and expulsion more than any other group, and though that too is important, we must begin to look at the unique ways in which gender and race are impacting Black girls in schools (Crenshaw, 2014; Morris, 2016).

The injustices experienced by all girls and boys are important; however, addressing these issues should not come at the expense of leaving the unique experiences of Black girls out of the room. This paper will address some of the scholarly frameworks that discuss the importance of not just including, but creating spaces for Black girls to ‘be.’ Schools must envision their
facilities as freeing, healing, and transformative spaces for Black girls and implement practices that aim to achieve these sorts of spaces.

Theoretical Frameworks

In order to provide a theoretical lens from which to view this paper, it is grounded in three main theories (briefly described below) — Intersectionality, Black Feminism, and Critical Race Theory. Through the use of these theories, the unique – yet diverse-- experiences of Black girls in public schools\(^1\) will be analyzed. Because Black girls are being criminalized, degraded both mentally and physically, and essentially denied the ability to ‘be’ full, free, and whole human beings as a consequence of beliefs, policies, and actions in public schools, it is argued—using the discussion from *Pushout: The Criminalization of Black Girls in Schools* by Dr. Monique Morris (2016)—that public schools should radically reimagine what schools could be. Schools should be transformative spaces of healing and growing for Black girls.

Intersectionality

Kimberlé Crenshaw (1989) wrote a legal article discussing the exclusion of Black women from feminist theory and antiracist policy. In it, she discussed how she was seeing a growing number of cases where Black women were losing legal battles because they either 1) could not be believed to have a real problem because women’s rights were passed; so, they could not be discriminated against because of their gender or 2) there were civil rights protecting Black

---

\(^1\) For the purposes of this study, I am choosing to focus on Black girls in public school settings. I have chosen to make the focus of my study public schools because, according to a study done by The National Center for Education Statistics in 2013, approximately 7.8 million, or 16%, of Black students are enrolled in public schools compared to 9% who are enrolled in private schools (National Center for Educational Statistics, 2016). These numbers lead me to believe that most Black girls are in public schools.
people from discrimination. What no one had seemed to notice was that Black women were facing multiple forms of oppression because of the combination of their womaness and Blackness. Thus, the term *Intersectionality*, uniquely created to discuss the way that multiple forms of oppression intersect, was coined. She wrote, “These problems of exclusion cannot be solved simply by including Black women within an already established analytical structure” (Crenshaw, 1989, p.140). Because Black women and girls face unique experiences, both as a group and individually, it is not enough to just include them in current conversations surrounding the treatment of Black boys. There must be research, advocacy, funding, and policy created that focuses on Black girls, their treatment, and their various identities and experiences.

**Black Feminism**

In her book, *Black Feminist Thought*, Patricia Collins (1990) discussed the path that many Black women such as Audre Lorde, Angela Davis, Toni Morrison, Alice Walker, and June Jordan created when they broke their silence in the 1970s. In turn, Black women in the 1980s and 1990s were able to develop and hone their collective voice about what Black womanhood was. Bell Hooks (1989) discussed how this voice was used to talk about issues concerning Black women. Just as Crenshaw (1989) noticed, Black women were sitting at an intersection that left both them and issues pertinent to them either excluded from traditional [white] feminism movements or ignored.
In *What’s in a Name? Womanism, Black Feminism, and Beyond*, Patricia Collins (1996) wrote:

Using the term ‘Black feminism’ disrupts the racism inherent in presenting feminism as a for-whites-only ideology and political movement. Inserting the adjective ‘Black’ challenges the assumed whiteness of feminism and disrupts the false universal of this term for both white and black women (p. 13).

The experiences of Black women and girls are not monolithic. In discussing this topic, it is important to understand that, though there are some experiences that many Black girls have in common, there are also many differences that Black girls carry. When discussing Black girls, it is important to take into account their family backgrounds, socioeconomic backgrounds, individual interest, sexual orientation, age, colorism, gender identity etc. and the ways in which these varying identities can further criminalize, dehumanize, or traumatize Black girls in public schools. Additionally, many of these experiences are different from some of the experiences of white women and other women of color. Black feminism calls for Black women to not prioritize their Blackness or their womaness. Instead, the two should be viewed as an inseparable unit.

**Critical Race Theory**

The tenets of Critical Race Theory (Delgado and Stefanic, 2012) are used in this paper in order to get a deeper and more complex understanding of some of the ways in which race and white supremacy are deeply embedded in society. The six tenets are:

1) Ubiquity of Racism: Racism is normal, ordinary, and not an aberration in the society that we live in.
2) Interest Convergence: Changes in the racial structure only occur when they are in the interest of those in power because racism itself sustains the material and psychic resources of those in power. Thus, these groups in power, predominantly white people, have little incentive to make changes in these societal structures that maintain their power.

3) Social Construction: Race is a social construct created by humans, but it is grounded in racial reality; the consequences are real. It is not an objective truth that corresponds to any biological evidence. Race is a categorical construct that is manipulated for convenience by those in power.

4) Differential Racialization: The dominant powers in society racialize different marginalized groups over time in response to the dynamic needs of the labor market.

5) Intersectionality and Antiessentialism: People are complex and thus have complex identities. Race is not a one-dimensional identity of any person and thus cannot be analyzed as such.

6) Voices of Color: The lived experiences of many people of color vastly differ from those portrayed in dominant white narratives, and thus are important to tell in order to show those who sustain these dominant narratives their existence.

Historical and Sociopolitical Context

The liberative power of education is something many Black women have been clear on even before they were able to legally read or write. Under slavery, it was illegal to educate people of African descent. In fact, according to the slave codes in states such as Alabama, it was
illegal and punishable by fine for any free person to teach a slave to spell, read, or write. If free Black people were taught teaching slaves, they were fined, whipped, and exiled from the state (Slave codes, 2017). Being able to read during slavery meant the possibility of challenging the oppressive and controlling nature of slavery. In her book, *Pushout: The Criminalization of Black Girls in Schools*, Dr. Monique Morris (2016) writes, “For many Black women, learning to read represented reclamation of human dignity and provided an opportunity to ground their challenges to the institution in scholarship, literature, and biblical scripture” (p. 5). Black women understood that an education would make it harder to stay entrapped in a system of servitude and poverty; therefore, they took the risk to become educated. Education has always been an important tool that supported opportunity in America.

Unfortunately, the inequities in education did not cease to exist with the abolition of slavery (Ladson-Billings, 2006; Morris, 2016; Cowen-Pitre, 2014). As Gloria Ladson-Billings (2006) discussed, there is an educational debt that is continuously growing through the constant deprivation, negligence, and dehumanization of Black and Brown children. Goff et al. (2014) argues that, unlike any other group of children, Black children are seen as less ‘childlike’ than their counterparts. In fact, according to his research study, this break from Black children being seeing as ‘childlike’ can be seen as early as ten-years-old. Historically, this has always been the case. From Slavery to Emmitt Till to Aiyanna Jones to Tamir Rice to Rekia Boyd, there have always been instances where extreme violence is used and justified because Black skin was

---

2 In this sense, Goff describes ‘childlike’ as being seen as innocent.
weaponized. As the article states, historians of genocide often argue that dehumanization is a necessary precondition for culturally and/or state-sanctioned violence—a view echoed by some social psychological theorists (2014).

Asylums, jails, reformatories, and other forms of group homes or holding facilities have been used for girls who found themselves in trouble with the law since the 18th century (Morris, 2016). However, Black children—including Black girls—were not able to attend these facilities. Instead, many Black youth who were seen participating in ‘unacceptable’ activities were sent to adult correctional facilities or left at the hands of lynch mobs. When reformist challenged this harsh treatment, rehabilitation homes were eventually opened for Black boys. Black girls who were labeled as prostitutes, drunks, mentally ill, and/or criminal found it much harder to find quality help—they were oftentimes left out of the discourses surrounding youth rehabilitation. Black girls who were able to attend reformatories were taught about how to be better servants to the elites of society (2016).

In her report, Kimberlé Crenshaw (2014) states,

Although males are suspended in greater numbers than females overall, race and ethnicity turn out to be substantial risk factors for Black girls when they are compared to their white counterparts. Data released by the Department of Education for the 2011–2012 school year reveal that while Black males were suspended more than three times as often as their white counterparts, Black girls were suspended six times as often. Only 2 percent of white females were
subjected to exclusionary suspensions in comparison to 12 percent of Black girls (p. 16).

Many scholars have addressed how narrowed and stereotypical views of Black femininity have contributed to the policing of Black girls’ bodies in schools (Crenshaw, 2014; Fordham, 1993; Morris, 2016; Townsend et al., 2010).

From January to March, ‘loud’ women are celebrated for speaking up when they felt that things were wrong; however, in everyday school practices, Black girls are penalized for being perceived as ‘too loud’ or having an attitude. Black girls are taught that they must submit to patriarchal norms in order to ‘pass’ in schools (Fordham, 1993). They must be smart, but not too smart. Their hair must be ‘presentable.’ Their bodies are sexualized and they are further penalized by harsh dress codes. When rehabilitation is discussed, it is only discussed in terms of rehabilitating back to a subservient, docile, and respectable person (Crenshaw, 2014; Morris, 2016; Townsend et al., 2010).

Currently, there is a failure to fully understand and make space for the wide scope of gender identities and backgrounds that Black girls embrace. Culturally competent and gender-responsive methods of teaching are ways to prevent the set up of damaging pathways for girls. This method must include an approach that responds to the girls who stand at the intersection of racism, sexism, colorism, poverty, transphobia, and homophobia. Furthermore, the discrimination against Black girls who have been detained or pushed out creates hostile and unwelcoming spaces for Black girls who attempt to re-enter the school. Black girls who are
experiencing pushout understand, just as Black women always have, the importance of quality education.

**Quality Learning Environments for Black Girls**

In *Pushout: The Criminalization of Black Girls in Schools* by Dr. Monique Morris (2016), she presents the reader with six themes that she—through her work with Black girls who were experiencing school pushout—found created the most quality learning environments for Black girls. These six themes are:

1) **The protection of girls from violence and victimization in school** - Morris (2016) states:

   When we take education away from them, Black girls are exposed to more violence, and they are more likely to be victimized and exploited, to become incarcerated, and to experience a lack of opportunity overall. When we prioritize discipline over learning in our educational institutions, we engage in reactive politics that maintain a status quo of inequality (p.178).

2) **Proactive discussions in schools about healthy intimate relationships** - As multiple scholars have discussed, the sexualization of the Black girl body has caused harm to many of the Black girls in schools. Therefore, both school personnel and community members should work to engage in topics surrounding healthy relationships.

3) **Strong student-teacher relationships** - Arguably one of the most important and influential connections that students make in adolescence, the student-teacher is one has the
potential to radically shift the direction of a child. Unfortunately, as Cowen-Pitre (2014) states:

As shown in the literature, unchallenged beliefs in educators can lead to complacency, acceptance of failure, and low expectation for African American students and other underserved student populations. The danger of unchallenged negative teacher beliefs about students of color is very clear, so it is imperative to acknowledge and address this issue (p. 214).

Black girls need teachers, administrators, and school policies that do not see their Black identity as something to fear or inferior.

4) School-based wraparound services- According to the Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports website, these wraparound services should be designed to build stronger and more constructive relationships. The guiding principles are: 1) strength-based family leadership; 2) team based; 3) flexible funding/services; 4) individualized; 5) perseverance; 6) outcome focused; 7) community based; 8) culturally competent; 9) natural supports; and 10) collaborative (Positive Behavioral Interventions & Supports - OSEP, 2017).

5) An increased focus on student learning coupled with a reduced emphasis on discipline and surveillance- learning environments that focus on surveilling and disciplining students make learning difficult. Many schools now have school resource officers (SROs) who patrol the school in order to ‘protect’ others from harm. Unfortunately, a quick
search on google shows us that, in some cases, these officers further harm Black girls.

Schools where SROs focus on the ‘resource’ part of their title instead of the ‘officer’ can potentially see a decrease of disciplinary issues.

6) Consistent school credit recovery process between alternative schools and traditional district or community schools- As previously mentioned in prior parts of this paper, education has always been seen as a liberative and imperative tool to lift oppressed people up out of their oppression. When Black girls are consistently missing school at the hands of pushout, there needs to be quality instruction that does not leave them behind.

Schools as Transformative Spaces

Creating a transformative space goes beyond solely teaching the curriculum. Teachers must be equipped with the tools and knowledge to combat their own prejudices, attitudes, and stereotypes about Black girls that often leave them invisible or deemed unsuitable for the class. As Morris (2016) states, “There are no throwaway children. We can, and must, do better (p. 179).”

Keys to a Transformative Space (from Pushout: The Criminalization of Black Girls in Schools)

A race conscious gender analysis- As previously mentioned, any discussion surrounding Black women and girls should be done so with the acknowledgement that Black women are both Black and women. These two cannot, and should not be attempted to, be separated. Black girls are subject to be caught between racialized and gendered policies that
further marginalize them. Interventions that schools, community members, policy makers, and advocates have to recognize the ways that Black girls are caught at varying intersections.

**Erasure of Respectability Politics in Schools** - Respectability politics have been prioritized over actual respect in schools. Schools must look beyond whether or not Black girls are wearing ‘tight’ pants, hair extensions, bright colored hair, or natural hairstyles. Data shows us that Black girls are receiving harsher punishments and pushout is growing. It is time for the focus to be shifted to the structures that are affecting Black girls in schools.

**A Centered Response to Victimization** - Black women and other women of color often experience higher rates of victimization, trauma, abuse, and exploitation than most other women (Adams, 2010; McGee and Stovall, 2015; Morris, 2016; Wakley & Cox, 2013). Black women and girls are expected to be able to ‘handle it all’ and have ‘grit.’ As McGee and Stovall (2015) state, “The psychological and emotional energy required to manage stress in academic and social contexts as well as systemic and everyday racism can be overwhelming and taxing (p.493).” Work with Black girls needs to produce physically, mentally, emotionally, and spiritually safe learning environments that encourage creative and forceful ways to combat victimization.

**High Expectations for All Students** - In many low-performing schools, where large amounts of school pushout occur, a profound belief in students and their capabilities is imperative (Morris, 2016; Cowen-Pitre, 2014). Regular professional development that supports teachers in their quest to use alternatives to exclusionary discipline practices is important if schools are truly dedicated to moving away from zero-tolerance policies. Morris (2016) states:
Teachers would benefit from training on the use of culturally competent and gender-responsive discipline protocols, objective decision-making training, and alternative practices that increase their capacity to utilize harm reduction strategies and promote safety, respect, and learning in the classroom (p. 184).

Engage in Practices that Facilitate Healing Opportunities for Black Girls- Peter Reason (1993) presented the term “sacred science” to describe his method of human inquiry that involves the nurturing of growth, love, beauty, wisdom, and compassionate action. Morris (2016) applied this lens to Black girls to give us a vision of what a path towards a truly transformative, holistic, and free from the trauma and harm Black girls have experienced in educational institutions and any other oppressive systems in society. Learning spaces should be places where Black girls can thrive without feeling the need to reject their own identity.

Trauma-informed care is a practice that understands that, for a person who has experienced a severe or extremely harmful event of series of events, there are certain behaviors, words, and conditions that trigger a negative reaction in her or him—oftentimes as a result to past abuse and/or neglect (Morris, 2016; Wakley & Cox, 2013). Trauma-informed learning environments provide considerations for the triggers that might cause the students physical or emotional harm. In these spaces, there is a respect for diversity of thought. Activities that might traditionally be seen as destructive or needing of punitive punishment are now met with discussions and restorative practices. Instead of viewing ‘talking back’ as an act of defiance or violence, it should be viewed as a reflective or critical mind. These seemingly small shifts in schools have the potential to largely impact Black girls in schools. Many community-based
organizations are already using trauma and healing informed practices in their work; they are moving towards healing (Morris, 2016; Wakley & Cox, 2013).

In addition to the ideas that Morris (2016) listed in her book, this paper will also include one that is based off one of the CRT tenets listed in a previous section: The Centering of Voices of Color and Experiential Knowledge. “Nothing about us, without us, is for us!” Any discussions that are happening about Black girls need to have the voice of Black girls in those conversations. It is important that the voices and stories of Black girls are truly heard. To enact policy without those voices is both problematic and dangerous. They are capable of telling their stories; in fact, if they know that they will be heard, many are willing to tell their stories. The counter-stories that go against the dominant, and oftentimes deficit based, view of Black girls in society provide a more robust and authentic view of the full and true stories of their lives.

Implications and Future Considerations

According to Crenshaw (2014), Black girls who are pushed out of schools face a greater likelihood of dropping out of school and having more contact with juvenile justice systems. Long term—this pushout can lead to Black girls having low-wage work or unemployment. The criminalization and social marginalization of Black girls go hand-in-hand with society’s prison-industrial complex. Furthermore, as Goff’s (2014) work shows us, Black children are being, just as they always have, denied the right to have one of the basic things that most children are able to have: the ability to make mistakes without harsh punishment.
The American public school system is supposed to provide a quality and equitable education to all youth. Unfortunately, as the previously presented research shows, for the most vulnerable and marginalized populations, this has not always been the case. Many of the girls that Crenshaw (2014) and Morris (2016) spoke to in their research were unable to describe the ways in which they best learn or express how they felt safe and valued in learning environments (Crenshaw, 2014; Morris, 2016).

In her discussion of the educational debt and why the historical, moral, sociopolitical, and economic debts must be discussed, Gloria Ladson-Billings (2006) states:

On the face of it, we must address it because it is the equitable and just thing to do. As Americans, we pride ourselves on maintaining those ideal qualities as hallmarks of our democracy. That represents the highest motivations for paying this debt (p. 9).

She further states, “…the cumulative effect of poor education, poor housing, poor health care, and poor government services create a bifurcated society that leaves more than its children behind” (p. 10). Black girls deserve the opportunity to participate in this nation’s promise of opportunity.

Moving forward, it is important that educators, policymakers, researchers, and community members see black girls as full and whole beings. In order for that to be accomplished, there needs to be a significant overhaul of what is being taught in teacher
education programs and professional development sessions. ‘Real’ conversations need to be happening both with students and educators. These conversations should discuss racism, sexism, transphobia, homophobia, poverty etc. In addition, the conversations have to move beyond just talk; I would be interested in seeing these conversations change to actions.

Quality teachers who also have personality and real-life knowledge, positive school leaders, non-punitive, non-rehabilitative structure, opportunities to volunteer and enhance career prospects are all specific elements that many Black girls consider to be important (Crenshaw, 2014; Morris, 2016). Learning spaces should be co-constructed. According to Morris (2016), Black girls want to see themselves as fully integrated into schools. They want to ask questions and talk, be talked to, be engaged, be heard, be respected, and be seen without having to give up pieces of their identity (Crenshaw, 2014; Fordham, 1993; Młynarczyk, 2014; Morris, 2016).

Limitations and Positionality

The purpose of this essay was to present research that has been completed by some of the leading CRT, Black feminist, and/or intersectional scholars who work with Black girls. Unfortunately, as previously stated in this essay, most of the research that has been completed surrounding school pushout, the school-to-prison pipeline, and criminalization of Black youth has been about Black boys. Therefore, though there has recently been more articles exploring the experiences of Black girls, there are still many areas that have yet to be explored.
I am a Black, cisgender, heterosexual woman from a middle-class background who also identifies as an intersectional Black feminist. I am also an educator, researcher, student, and sister or an adolescent Black girl. Undoubtedly, the literature reviewed for this essay was processed through my own cultural lens. It is my belief that, until we are all free, none of us are free.
References


Retrieved from
=true&db=28h&AN=55505349&site=ehost-live&scope=site


Retrieved from
=true&db=28h&AN=55505349&site=ehost-live&scope=site


http://www.jstor.org.proxy.library.vanderbilt.edu/stable/41068619


https://doi.org/10.1525/aeq.1993.24.1.05x1736t


